

EXHIBIT "A"

PUBLIC HEARING MINUTES

MINUTES OF THE PUBLIC HEARINGS FOR THE VAN RENSSELAER HEIGHTS APARTMENTS

The City of Rensselaer Industrial Development Agency (the "IDA") held a public hearing before the Common Council of the City of Rensselaer on May 2, 2018 at 6:35 PM for the Renwyck Place Apartments and the proposed bond issuance for the acquisition, rehabilitation and equipping of the Van Rensselaer Heights Apartments located 460 Forbes Avenue, City of Rensselaer, Rensselaer County, New York. Council President Richard Mooney opened the public hearing at approximately 6:51 PM immediately following the conclusion of the Renwyck Place Apartments public hearing and asked Special Counsel to the City of Rensselaer (the "City") to briefly explain the purpose of the public hearing.

Special Counsel Paul Goldman then indicated that Van Rensselaer Heights Apartments is located at 460 Forbes Avenue in the City of Rensselaer and it consists of 107 one and two bedroom apartment units which are subject to HAP Contract with Housing and Urban Development. The proposed bond issue is estimated at approximately \$10,000,000 and that approximately \$5,322,532 is estimated to be spend on the renovation of the Van Rensselaer Heights Apartments. Special Counsel then advised the public that the purpose of the public hearing was to receive comment from interested persons on the issuance of the tax-exempt bonds and to discuss the nature of the improvements to be made from the proceeds of the bonds. Special Counsel then asked the public to limit the comments to the project and the bond issue and to refrain from unrelated matters.

Council President Richard Mooney then asked any interested persons to come to the microphone and set their name and address.

Joanne Bailey of the Van Rensselaer Heights apartments indicated that we need to live in the here and now. There were pictures in the common area that have been made eliminated. Ms. Bailey indicated that there were blowers in the hallway so that it is either too hot or too cold. Ms. Bailey indicated that there has to be accountability for the rents and the security deposits. Ms. Bailey stated that if you are silent you are lied to and if you speak up you have a target on your back. Ms. Bailey indicated that there needs to be integrity in the review of the request by Millennia not smoke and mirrors.

Bonnie Hahn of 1 Broadway indicated that a review of the New York State Secretary of State website confirms that North River Meadows is an out of state company that was recently formed. Ms. Hahn indicated that the application did not have any financial statements on North River Meadows. Ms. Hahn indicated that the application to the IDA was incomplete as it lacked the following information: (a) organizational chart; (b) listing of affiliated entities; (c) certified financial statements for the company; (d) reference that the Rensselaer Housing Authority was the lead agency; (e) no cost benefit analysis; and (e) what is the PILOT Agreement with the company. Ms. Hahn indicated that she spoke with Marianne Ogren of the Rensselaer Housing

Authority and that she was not aware of the taxes and/or a PILOT Agreement. Ms. Hahn indicated that there was no information on the jobs to be created.

Gloria Brandow of Van Rensselaer Heights Apartment 200 indicated that Millennia has had five different managers and that one manager left because there was a disagreement as to how the seniors were being treated. Ms. Brandow indicated that there is only one coordinator between Renwyck and Van Rensselaer and that was not sufficient. Ms. Brandow indicated that there is a need for increased inspections at Van Rensselaer. Ms. Brandow indicated that she felt threatened in her discussions with the property manager. Ms. Brandow indicated that Millennia received a grant for \$15,000 for the gardens and that money was not properly expended in that several pine trees were removed without adequate replacements. Ms. Brandow indicated that the gardens were not properly and timely fixed since it took 1.5 years to renovate the gardens.

Janet McCauley a resident of Van Rensselaer Heights indicated that she has lived at Van Rensselaer Heights for approximately nine years. Ms. McCauley indicated that she freezes in the winter and that there is no air conditioning in the summer. Ms. McCauley indicated that the flowers that were planted by her mother in the garden were ripped out and nothing was ever put back in replacement.

Anna Ader spoke and confirmed that she advocates for the needs of the elderly residents. Ms. Ader indicated that the apartments in question need to be available to serve the needs of the blind and elderly. Ms. Ader indicated that the improvements that are to be made should be aligned with the need of providing for adaptive living for the handicapped seniors. Ms. Ader indicated that the resident's rights may have been violated by the management.

Special Counsel Goldman indicated to Ms. Ader that the public hearing was about the proposed bond issue and the renovation work that is proposed to be undertaken at Van Rensselaer Heights and that she has instances of how the property can be renovated to serve the needs of the elderly and/or handicapped please provide that information to the Common Council.

Samuel Berdick of Van Rensselaer Heights Apartment 314 indicated that he is disabled and has lived in Van Rensselaer Heights Apartments for nine years. Mr. Berdick indicated that he grew up in New York City tenements and that he is thankful that Van Rensselaer Heights does not feel like a tenement but he fears that it could become a tenement if it is not fixed up. Mr. Berdick indicated that we need new toilets and a new paint job. Mr. Berdick indicated that you (i.e. Common Council) need to help us and let them fix the properties up. Mr. Berdick indicated to the balance of the audience that we will not get anywhere unless we allow the properties to be fixed up.

Bill Worden of Millennia Housing indicated that Millennia Housing is presently only the property manager for the owner and that they have limited control on the improvements since that requires the approval of the Owner. Mr. Worden indicated that since he became the manager he is undertaking more frequent inspections and there are monthly meetings with the manager and resident. Mr. Worden indicated that when Millennia acquires Van Rensselaer Heights, the renovation will commence immediately after the sale.

John Maurer of Millennia Housing indicated that he is the Property Manager at Renwyck and that Millennia is a leader in renovation of low income housing projects and tax credit conversion. Mr. Maurer showed two poster boards and spoke about the quality of the renovation.

Special Counsel Goldman asked Mr. Maurer to refocus his comments to the purposes of the public hearing and specifically about the scope and extent of the renovation work to be performed. Special Counsel indicated that Mr. Maurer should stop his sales pitch and tell the Common Council and the audience about the scope of repair and renovation work that will be undertaken by Millennia at each project. Special Counsel Goldman indicated that it was obvious that there is a problem with the current mechanical systems at each project and he needed to provide some detail to the Common Council and the public on the scope of the improvements to the mechanical systems. Special Counsel Goldman asked Mr. Maurer to provide some information on the mechanicals.

Mr. Maurer indicated that he did not have that information this evening.

Special Counsel Goldman specifically asked Mr. Maurer as a follow up to the public hearing to provide the scope of the renovation and repair work to the heat and cooling systems in each building.

Ms. Janet McCauley of Van Rensselaer Heights asked whether the City can afford this renovation work.

Special Counsel Goldman stated that the proposed bonds are special purpose bond where neither the City of Rensselaer nor the City of Rensselaer IDA guarantees the repayment of the bond issues. None of the City's taxing revenues are pledged as a security for the bond issue. Specifically, the bond owners look only to each project for the repayment of the bonds and if the project is unable to pay the debt service then they take over the project. Special Counsel Goldman indicated that neither the City nor its IDA are responsible for the repayment of the bonds.

City Clerk Nancy Hardt asked Millennia to provide details on the specific improvements to the mechanical systems that will be made at each property.

Councilman Casey asked for a specific timeline for the completion of the renovation work since he stated that this all sounds good but we need assurances that the work will be completed.

Councilman Anders asked Millennia how Millennia will undertake the renovation work and specifically how is it that Millennia will undertake the work in the individual apartments without removing the tenants.

Mr. Worden of Millennia indicated that they provide a hospitality suite where a tenant whose unit is being worked upon will go to during the day that construction is undertaken in their unit. Mr. Worden stated that at the end of the day the unit that is being renovated is cleaned such that the resident will be back in their apartment that is cleaned up at the end of the working period. Mr. Worden indicated that each unit will be left in a fully functional condition at the end of each day so that the resident can return at the end of each day.

Councilman Gardner indicated that he was concerned about not displacing any tenant from their unit and that he is a contractor and is concerned about how construction projects tend to lag and are delayed and the impact on the residents. Councilman Gardner indicated that he wanted some actual examples of similar projects having a renovation with continued occupancy by the tenants. Council Gardner indicated that he would only support the bond issue if there were enforceable deadlines for the completion of each project.

Special Council Goldman indicated that the final resolution of the Common Council could be subject to a deadline for completion of the renovation work such that there was no lingering long term construction project.

Common Council President Mooney asked the audience in attendance if there were any other comments and hearing none turned the floor over to Special Counsel Goldman.

Special Counsel Goldman indicated that there would be no vote on the bond issue tonight and that he indicated that the Common Council would continue to receive information and comment on each of the project up to Monday May 14, 2018. All information should be provided to the City Clerk for redistribution to the Common Council. Special Counsel Goldman indicated that it was obvious there was a problem with the mechanical systems at each property but that the solution was not a continuation of the same pattern of neglect. Specifically it seemed that a renovation was needed and it was the only way to achieve the repairs of the problems noted by the residents. Special Counsel Goldman indicated that there was really not two different sides to the issue since we all want the same thing which is safe, decent and clean affordable housing for the senior citizens and handicapped residents of the City. We are on the same side. Special Counsel Goldman stated that getting some entity to invest substantial sums in each project could potentially bring about improvement rather than doing nothing which was not really an acceptable option.

Special Counsel Goldman responded to the comments from Bonnie Hahn as follows:

- a) Financing of tax credit housing transactions for low income housing projects is typically undertaken with single purpose entities that are recently formed such that there are no financial statements for new formed entities.
- b) Organization Chart will be requested. Millennia Housing has a long history of undertaking low income housing tax credit projects so that they should provide a project ownership listing.
- c) The reference to the Rensselaer Housing Authority as the lead agent was a typographical error that stemmed from the prior bond issue in 2012 that will be paid off from the proceeds of the subject bond issues with Millennia Housing.
- d) Cost Benefit Analysis will be provided to the IDA prior to any final vote on the bonds.
- e) The proposed PILOT Agreement was provided to the Common Council but it will not be less than the existing payment with a three 3% escalation with a schedule that was provided to the Common Council. In addition, Mr. Goldman indicated that the final approval of the PILOT Agreement was subject to a final approval of the IDA.

Special Counsel Goldman indicated that as a summary he would request that Millennia Housing provide to the Common Council the following responsive documents to the Common Council:

- a) Information on the Contractor for the renovation projects
- b) Information on the Mechanical Contractor and the scope of work to be undertaken to repair the heat and mechanical systems in each building.
- c) Examples of similar renovation projects undertaken by Millennia where the property remained occupied during the renovation.
- d) Need to establish a deadline for the delivery of the completed project
- e) Need to establish and confirm the existing of a Regulatory Agreement which ensures occupancy of the respective property for senior citizens and handicapped individual
- f) Confirmation of long term HAP Contract with HUD and/or assignment and assumption of the HAP Contract to Millennia Housing

Special Counsel Goldman indicated that the City Clerk would receive public comment until Monday May 14, 2014.

Common Council President then moved to close the public hearing for Van Rensselaer Heights Apartments at 7:20 PM wherein the Common Council took a short recess.